

International Center for Insurance Regulation

### Prof. Dr. Helmut Gründl

# Interconnectedness between Banking and Insurance

Frankfurt, September 5, 2013



## Interconnectedness between Banking and Insurance





**Global Insurance Supervision:** 

- Not possible without taking interconnectedness in the financial area into account
- Interconnectedness an important issue in the discussion on systemic risk

Long-term goal: not only Global Insurance Supervision,

**but Global Financial Services Supervision** 

## Interconnectedness between Banking and Insurance

# Agenda

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Regulatory Issues
  - Basel Accords vs. Insurance Regulation
  - Bail-in Debt
- 3. Research



## Introduction Can insurance companies be systemically important?

The Basel Committee's assessment methodology identifies five categories to measure **banks**' systemic importance The IAIS' assessment methodology identifies five categories to measure **insurers**' relative systemic importance



The potential for systemic risk in insurance may become relevant when insurers significantly deviate from the traditional insurance business model and/or become highly interconnected with the banking industry



HOUSE OF FINANCE

Interconnectedness dimensions: Bonds and equity capital





### Europe

In 2011, insurers held around 12% of all banking-sector liabilities to non-banks<sup>1</sup>

### Germany

Estimated proportion of insurers' assets invested in bank bonds, bank loans and bank deposits is between 39% and 43%<sup>2</sup>

Bank bonds represent an important part of insurers' asset portfolios

(1) Deutsche Bank Research (2011) (2) Kaserer (2011)

## Bank bonds in life insurance portfolios





### On the one hand: natural connection

- Long duration of life insurers' liabilities
- Long duration of bank loans
- Present duration mismatch in both sectors can be mitigated by issuing and holding long duration bank bonds

### On the other hand: contagion risk

- The default of bank bonds held by insurers leads to a decline in insurers' asset values
- Additional danger if bank bond defaults originate in events that also directly affect insurers.

E.g.: The default of sovereign debt held by insurers (on average 28% in 2011) affects insurers' balance sheets directly and indirectly via bank bonds

• Financial conglomerate:

**Reputational risk** due to financial distress in the other sector

# Agenda

### 1. Overview

### 2. Regulatory Issues

- Basel Accords vs. Insurance Regulation
- Bail-in Debt
- 3. Research



Regulatory approaches for banking and insurance: Interconnectedness between banking and insurance not taken into account





Example: Basel Accords and Solvency II

### Basel II / III

- Requires banks to establish more stable, long-term sources of funding
- Financing Instruments will only be recognized as Tier 1 and Tier 2 if they include loss-absorbing components.

### Solvency II

- Motivates insurers to close the duration gap (via interest rate risk module)
- However, capital requirements for corporate/bank bonds become more stringent as maturity periods increase and credit ratings deteriorate (spread risk module constraint)

### Interdependencies and overall effects on, e.g., loan supply?





### Liikanen proposal

• Resurrecting market discipline in banking via funding:

Mandatory issuance of bail-in debt

- In financial distress, these bonds can be converted into equity (CoCo bonds)
- They must be priced accordingly (high coupon compensates for high expected loss)
- Bondholders must be non-banks

## **Bail-in Debt**







- Bail-in debt as complement not substitute to more equity capital
- Risk is shifted to whom?
  - Life insurance companies
  - Pension funds
  - Hedge funds

## Bail-in debt – an ideal investment for life insurers?

Are life insurers natural holders of CoCo-Bank Bonds?





- Life insurers less exposed to short-time customer reactions than banks (bank run versus insurance run)
- Compensation of insurers via high spread that must be accumulated in a "catastrophe reserve"
- Thus, after e.g. 15 years, a complete default could be financed via the additional spread

### Assessment

- Life insurers' task is to provide safety for their policyholders, not for banks
- How do policyholders participate?
- However, if the terms are appropriate, why not invest in bail-in-bonds?
- Especially relevant in the present low-interest rate phase
- Effects must be thoroughly studied

# Agenda

- 1. Overview
- 2. Regulatory Issues
  - Basel Accords vs. Insurance Regulation
  - Bail-in Debt
- 3. Research



## Research





# Recent research on systemic risk and interconnectedness in banking and insurance

 Chen, Cummins, Viswanathan and Weiss (2013) "Systemic risk and the interconnectedness between Banks and Insurers: An Econometric Analysis", forthcoming, Journal of Risk and Insurance

Findings:

- Banks create significant systemic risk for insurers but not vice versa
- Insurers seem to be the victims of systemic risk rather than instigators

## Research





# Recent research on systemic risk and interconnectedness in banking and insurance

 Slijkerman, Schoenmaker and de Vries (2013) "Systemic risk and diversification across European banks and insurers", Journal of Banking & Finance, Vol. 37, pp. 773-785

Findings:

- Significant downside-risk dependence between banking and insurance sectors
- They conclude that the probability of a crash is lower if European banks diversify across other sectors (→ bail-in debt)

## Research at the ICIR and SAFE







### "Optimal Risk Policies for Interconnected Banks and Insurers in the Presence of Solvency Regulation"

- Regulatory effects on the interconnectedness of banking and insurance
- Shareholder value perspective of both banks and insurers
- "Drivers" of the model: customer reactions
  - Depositors on the banking side
  - Policyholders on the insurance side

## Research at the ICIR and SAFE



HOUSE OF FINANCE

## "Optimal Risk Policies for Interconnected Banks and Insurers in the Presence of Solvency Regulation"

 Effect of Basel II / III and Solvency II on asset allocation in both sectors and interconnectedness via bank bonds



## Research at the ICIR and SAFE



HOUSE OF FINANCE

"Optimal Risk Policies for Interconnected Banks and Insurers in the Presence of Solvency Regulation"

- First findings and outlook
  - Customer sensitivity to default risk as well as regulatory rules that influence interconnectedness are crucial for overall riskiness
  - Industry-specific regulatory safety levels and risk measurement lead in their interplay – to different levels of contagion risk between banks and insurers
  - Identify combinations of regulatory safety targets leading to beneficial or detrimental outcomes (for customers and / or owners)

## Backup







## Liste der system relevanten Banken

Citigroup **Deutsche Bank HSBC** JP Morgan Chase Barclays **BNP** Paribas Bank of America Bank of New York Mellon **Credit Suisse Goldman Sachs** Mitsubishi UFJ FG Morgan Stanley Royal Bank of Scotland UBS

Bank of China **BBVA** Groupe BPCE Group Crédit Agricole **ING Bank** Mizuho FG Nordea Santander Société Générale Standard Chartered State Street Sumitomo Mitsui FG Unicredit Group Wells Fargo

## Overview - Bank bonds in life insurance portfolios

### On the one hand natural connection

- The duration of insurers' liabilities is longer than that of their assets.
- The duration of banks' assets is longer than that of their liabilities.
- Duration problem for both sectors can be mitigated

### On the other hand contagion risk

- The default of bank bonds held by insurers leads to a decline in insurers' asset values. .
- Additional danger if bank bond defaults originate in events that also affect insurers directly, e.g.: The default of sovereign debt held by insurers



The reciprocal effects have to be considered. Default of sovereign debt held by insurers affects insurers' balance sheet directly and indirectly via bank bonds.



HOUSE OF FINANCE

## **Overview – Global Systemically Important Institutes**

### **Global Systemically Important Institutes**



HOUSE OF FINANCE

#### 28 G-SIBs:

Citigroup State Stree **ING Bank** HSBC Credit Suisse **Deutsche Bank** Barclays S<sub>antander</sub> JP Morgan Chase Wells Fargo Bank of New York Mellon Bank of America BNP Paribas Bank of China Mizuho FG Goldman Sachs Mitsubishi UFJ FG Royal Bank of Scotland Société Générale UBS Standard Chartered s BBVA Morgan Stanley Group Crédit Agricole Groupe BPCE Unicredit Group Sumitomo Mitsui FG

### 9 G-SIIs:

- Allianz SE
- American International Group, Inc.
- Assicurazioni Generali S.p.A.
- Aviva plc
- Axa S.A.
- MetLife, Inc.
- Ping An Insurance (Group) Company of China, Ltd.
- Prudential Financial, Inc.
- Prudential plc

## Global Systemically Important Institutes (G-SII)





#### 28 G-SI Banks

Citigroup State Stree ING Barik HSBC Credit Suisse Deutsche Bank Barclays S<sub>antander</sub> JP Morgan Chase America Chase York Mellon Saria Bank of New York Mellon Goldman Sacha Bank of America BNP Paribas Bank of China Mitsubishi UFJ FG Mitsubishi UFJ FG Mizuho FG Goldman Sachs Royal Bank of Scotland Société Générale UBS Standard Chartered ы BBVA Morgan Stanley Group Crédit Agricole Groupe BPCE Unicredit Group Sumitomo Mitsui FG

### 9 G-SI Insurers

Assicurazioni Generali S.p.A. American International Group, Inc. Allianz SE Ping An Insurance (Group) Company of China, Ltd Prudential plc Axa S.A. MetLife, Inc.